

Tetsuro Chihara, William D. Cline and Toshiko Sakurai

## If the cloze test is a question, is the C-test the answer?

While the cloze test has been criticized for varying in its validity depending upon the deletion rate (Alderson, 1979), the C-test has been proposed a viable alternative. To find whether or not the C-test is superior to the cloze test, four C-tests were prepared for the present study. Two tests followed the basic procedure of deleting the second half of every second word beginning from the second sentence. In two experimental tests, deletions started from the first word of the second sentence. Four hundred forty Japanese junior college students took part in the experiment. One hundred seventy-five of the students had also taken the TOEFL so their TOEFL scores were correlated with the C-test results. Significant differences were found in the scores of two tests. All four tests correlated satisfactorily with TOEFL total scores and all four tests had satisfactory reliability.

### 1. Introduction

The cloze test has achieved considerable popularity and credit as a reliable and valid instrument for measuring foreign language proficiency. It has been in use over thirty years and numerous studies have supported its validity and reliability (Oller, 1979). In recent years, however, the cloze test has been reported to have some serious defects (Alderson, 1979; Klein-Braley, 1983, 1985; Klein-Braley & Raatz, 1984; Raatz & Klein-Braley, 1982). One of the major problems seems to be in the construct validity of the cloze tests. Alderson (1979) argues that the cloze procedure is not automatically valid and reliable for producing tests. Since the deletion rate chosen affects the test performance, each cloze test must be validated each time it is administered. Raatz & Klein-Braley (1982) share his doubts about generalization of the cloze procedure. They claim that every  $n$ th word deletion procedure does not ensure the random sampling theory which is crucial for tests of reduced redundancy. Cloze tests are tests of reduced redundancy which require test takers to utilize what Oller calls their pragmatic expectancy grammar. A cloze passage is a sample of language and the student's performance on any one passage is generalized to represent his performance on any other sample of language. In order for the results of a cloze test to

be generalized, the sample of language must be random. However, changes in texts, deletion rate, and starting points also change the ratio of content and structural words deleted in the cloze text, and that affects not only the difficulty of the test but its reliability and validity. Some cloze tests turn out to be valid and reliable while others have low reliability and validity coefficients.

The C-test, developed by Raatz & Klein-Braley in 1981, is a modification of the cloze procedure, still retaining the underlying theory of general language proficiency. In the C-test, starting from the second sentence, the second half of every second word in the text is deleted (cf. Grotjahn, 1987). Dörnyei & Katona (1992), and Raatz & Klein-Braley (1982), have reported results with the C-test which support the superiority of the C-test to the traditional cloze procedure.

In order to reveal whether every second word deletion in C-tests gives a representative sample of the words in the whole texts, Raatz & Klein-Braley (1982) chose 40 English and 40 German texts, each with 200 words, and compared the proportion of content and structural words deleted for the C-tests to that of those in the original texts. The results show that the procedure assures the random sampling theory.

Concurrent validity of C-tests was also examined. Klein-Braley & Raatz (1982, 1984) report correlations of the C-tests in several languages: the English version, .36 - .72 and .62 - .90 with the Delta Test; the German version, .82 - .85 with the AWO Test; the French version, .87 with the Bochum French Placement Test. In Negishi's study (1987), the correlation coefficients of a C-test with the ELBA Test were .76 for the total test and .80 for the reading comprehension section. Dörnyei & Katona (1992) report positive correlations of the C-test with a Department Proficiency Test, (total) .43, with the TOEIC (total) .62, and .43 with an Oral Interview.

In the present study we asked the following questions:

1. Will the C-test have the same results with either first or second word deletion starting points in terms of the ratio of content and structure words and test difficulty? Our hypothesis was that there should be no significant difference in C-test results using either the Basic second or an Experimental first word deletion starting point (cf. Grotjahn, 1987, pp. 227f., however, for a possible significant effect of a first word deletion starting point).

2. Does the C-test produce high validity coefficients with a reliable and valid criterion in the Basic and Experimental versions?
3. Will two different C-tests developed with different passages both produce valid results as claimed? Klein-Braley & Raatz (1984, p. 145) write "It seems probable that, provided the C-Test is suitable in its level of difficulty for the target group envisaged, it will, in the majority of cases, produce valid results."

## 2. Method

### 2.1 Pilot test

A standard C-test suggested by Raatz & Klein-Braley (1982) consists of four independent paragraphs with about 80 words and 25 deletions in each paragraph giving a total of 100 deletions. The purpose of the pilot test was to prepare two C-test forms for the present experiment. Twelve passages of about 80 words with varying degrees of readability were collected and divided into three forms. The four passages in each form were arranged from easiest to most difficult so that each form became fairly comparable to one another. Deletion of the second half of words began from the second word of the second sentence in each passage. The subjects were 180 Japanese junior college students. They were randomly divided into three groups and each group took one of the three forms of the C-test. We calculated the mean and standard deviation of each passage and selected eight out of the twelve original ones, so that we had two forms of almost identical difficulty, each form consisting of four passages. These were A Basic and B Basic forms. (However, in the main experiment, the difficulty of the two tests turned out to be different.)

### 2.2 Main experiment

#### 2.2.1 Materials

Two additional forms of the C-test were prepared, A Experimental and B Experimental, using the same tests as A Basic and B Basic. In Experimental forms, deletions started from the first word of the second sentence. Basic and Experimental C-tests are shown in the Appendix.

### 2.2.2 Subjects

We used a completely different population from the one that took the pilot test. The subjects tested were 440 Japanese junior college students, all female, majoring in English. Of 440 students tested, 175 had taken the TOEFL Test.

### 2.2.3 Procedure

The students were randomly divided into two main groups. In order to minimize the order effect, one half of the first group took a set of tests consisting of A Basic and B Experimental, and the other half took B Experimental and A Basic. The order was reversed for the second group with one half taking B Basic and A Experimental, while the other half took A Experimental and B Basic. A written instruction was given on how to perform the C-test with an example. The students were allowed to spend 60 minutes writing answers.

The exact-word scoring method was employed. First, reliability coefficients were calculated on each form and condition, followed by analysis of variance with Conditions (Basic or Experimental) and Forms (A or B) as independent variables. Meanwhile, the ratio of content words and structural words in each C-test form was calculated and compared with the ratio of content and structural words in the whole texts. We used Fries' (1952) definition of content and structural words.

The C-test's validity was studied through correlation with the TOEFL scores. Pearson Product-Moment Correlation Coefficients were calculated between the C-test scores and TOEFL total scores as well as the listening, structure, and vocabulary and reading subtests.

## 3. Results and discussion

The four C-tests forms were scored by the exact-word scoring method. Table 1 shows the mean scores, standard deviations, and KR-21 formula reliability coefficients for the tests. All four tests were found to be satisfactorily reliable. Overall, subjects did better on the second word deletion starting point than the first regardless of form (66.850% versus 64.996%), and did better on form A than form B regardless of condition (68.539% versus 63.307%). However, the interaction between condition and form should be taken into account; there is no effect of condition for form A but probably an effect for form B.

**Table 1**  
Mean scores, standard deviations and reliability coefficients on C-tests by form and condition

Form	Condition	Mean Score (%)	SD	Reliability (KR-21)	N
A	Basic	68.582	9.29	.758	220
A	Experimental	68.496	10.439	.810	220
B	Basic	65.118	10.515	.803	220
B	Experimental	61.496	9.559	.748	220
Overall Means					
A		68.539			440
B		63.307			440
Basic		66.850			440
Experimental		64.996			440

A chi-square test of the proportion of content words and structural words in the four C-tests compared with the original texts revealed that there was no significant difference in the ratios of such words with the original texts (see Tables 2 and 3). Therefore, the four C-tests used in the present study were found to provide a random sampling of language for testing.

**Table 2**  
Ratio of content words and structural words in C-tests by form and condition

	Form A			Form B		
	Basic (deletions only)	Experimental (deletions only)	Whole Passage	Basic (deletions only)	Experimental (deletions only)	Whole Passage
Content Words (Ratio)	49 (49%)	43 (43%)	152 (48.7%)	49 (49%)	53 (53%)	165 (49.8%)
Structural Words (Ratio)	51 (51%)	57 (57%)	160 (51.3%)	51 (51%)	47 (47%)	166 (50.2%)
Total	100	100	312	100	100	331

**Table 3**  
Chi-square analyses of the proportion of content words and structural words in the four C-tests compared with the original texts

Form and Condition	df	Chi-square	p
Basic Form A	1	.002	.964
Experimental Form A	1	.993	.319
Basic Form B	1	.022	.882
Experimental Form B	1	.305	.581

A two factor analysis of variance was run over the C-test scores with condition (Basic or Experimental) and with form (A or B). The results from this analysis are given in Table 4. The *F*-ratio for condition was 7.618 and that for form 60.676. The effects of condition and form exceeded the critical value at  $p < .01$ , so the hypotheses of no difference between the deletion starting points and no difference for form can be rejected. The interaction of condition and form was also significant ( $p < .01$ ). This means that significant differences in the mean scores by different deletion starting points may be due to the second factor, form.

**Table 4**  
Two factor analysis of variance for form and condition

Source	df	SS	MS	F-ratio	p
Condition	1	756.655	756.655	7.618	.006
Form	1	6021.823	6021.823	60.626	.000
Condition × Text	1	687.823	687.823	6.925	.009
Explained	3	7466.300	2488.767	25.056	.000
Residual	876	87010.445	99.327		
Total	879	94476.745	107.482		

The C-test scores of the four forms were correlated with the TOEFL total scores as well as TOEFL subtests of 175 subjects (Section 1: listening; Section 2: structure; and section 3: vocabulary and reading comprehension). Table 5 shows the matrix of Pearson product-moment correlation coefficients between those tests. Correlations between TOEFL total scores and C-tests were higher than those between TOEFL subtests and the C-

tests, which suggests that the C-tests measure students' overall ability in English rather than any one sub-skill. While Negishi (1987) reported the highest correlation between the C-test and the ELBA reading comprehension subtest (.80) and Chapelle & Abraham (1990) reported that the C-test correlated most strongly with the EPT vocabulary test (.836), rather high correlation with the TOEFL Listening section (.641) and Structure section (.616) were observed in the present study. With the results obtained in the present study, it can be said that the C-tests seem to measure something similar to what the TOEFL measures in students' English proficiency.

**Table 5**  
Matrix of product-moment correlations  
(a) Between the C-tests and TOEFL

	A Basic (N = 82)	A Experimental (N = 93)	B Basic (N = 93)	B Experimental (N = 82)
TOEFL Sec 1	.417	.611	.569	.357
TOEFL Sec 2	.474	.582	.615	.430
TOEFL Sec 3	.381	.469	.498	.482
TOEFL Total	.565	.646	.652	.552

(b) Between TOEFL and subtests

	TOEFL Sec 1 (N = 175)	TOEFL Sec 2 (N = 175)	TOEFL Sec 3 (N = 175)	TOEFL Total (N = 175)
TOEFL Sec 1	—			
TOEFL Sec 2	.630	—		
TOEFL Sec 3	.562	.637	—	
TOEFL Total	.857	.873	.850	—

#### 4. Conclusion

Our present study revealed that the four C-tests were representative samples of language as far as the ratio of content and structural words in the text were concerned. It also showed that these C-tests were validated with TOEFL. In addition, reliability for all four tests was quite satisfactory. The highest correlations were with the four C-tests and the TOEFL Total scores. This seems to indicate that the C-test is a measure of general language pro-

iciency. In these respects, the four C-tests used in this study did not show the variance reported with cloze tests (Alderson, 1979).

Two C-tests in this study had significantly different scores with differing deletion starting points. This may have been due to the differing deletion starting points or it may have been due to differing forms. By starting deletions in the C-test from the first word of the second sentence, we are not proposing a new type of test. Nevertheless, significantly differing scores obtained from different C-tests indicate that we should continue to heed the advice given more than ten years ago that, "... every C-test developed at this point of time should be very carefully examined" (Raatz & Klein-Braley, 1982, p. 134).

### Acknowledgments

The authors gratefully acknowledge the assistance of Tomoko Yashima, Yasyo Edasawa, and Yoko Hookabe.

### References

- Alderson, Charles J. (1979). The cloze procedure and proficiency in English as a foreign language. *TESOL Quarterly*, 13, 219-226.
- Chapelle, Carol A. & Abraham, Roberta. (1990). Cloze method: what difference does it make? *Language Testing*, 7(2), 121-146.
- Dörnyei, Zoltán & Katona, Lucy. (1992). Validation of the C-test amongst Hungarian EFL learners. *Language Testing*, 9(2), 187-206.
- Fries, Charles C. (1952). *The structure of English*. New York: Harcourt, Brace & Co.
- Grotjahn, Rüdiger. (1987). How to construct and evaluate a C-Test: A discussion of some problems and some statistical analyses. In Rüdiger Grotjahn, Christine Klein-Braley & Douglas K. Stevenson (Eds.), *Taking their measure: The validity and validation of language tests* (pp. 219-253). Bochum: Brockmeyer.
- Klein-Braley, Christine. (1983). A cloze is a cloze is a question. In John W. Oller, Jr. (Ed.), *Issues in language testing research* (pp. 218-228). Rowley, Mass.: Newbury House.
- Klein-Braley, Christine. (1985). A cloze-up on the C-test: a study in the construct validation of authentic tests. *Language Testing*, 2, 76-104.

Klein-Braley, Christine & Raatz, Ulrich. (1984). A survey of research on the C-test. *Language Testing*, 1, 134-146.

Oller, John W. Jr. (1979). *Language tests at school: a pragmatic approach*. London: Longman.

Negishi, Masashi. (1987). The C-Test: an integrative measure? *IRLT Bulletin*, 1, 3-26.

Raatz, Ulrich & Klein-Braley, Christine. (1982). The C-test - a modification of the cloze procedure. In Terry Culhane, Christine Klein-Braley & Douglas K. Stevenson (Eds.), *Practice and problems in language testing* 7 (pp. 113-138). Colchester: University of Essex.

## Appendix: C-test passages

### Basic Form A:

1. The evening news on television is very popular with many Americans. They like to find out what is happening in the world. On television they can see real people and places. They believe it is easier than reading the newspaper. Many people think television makes the news seem more real. They also think the news on television is more interesting. Television news reporters sometimes tell funny stories and even jokes. This makes the news about wars and crime seem less terrible.

2. The journalist must write only what is true. He must never change facts to please a person or any group. You should know that so many of your readers may not like and may even be angered by your stories. If your facts are true, they are also that important. It is not necessary for you to please everyone. It is much better for your readers to get news which is complete and true.

3. Luckily he was flying at a good height when this misfortune happened, and he had time to look for a place to land. Below him he could see a number of fields which looked flat enough to land on, and he succeeded in bringing his machine down on one of them. It was not as difficult as it had looked from the air, but he landed safely and jumped out to look around where he was.

4. What has occurred since the last Ice Age, when the Alps were buried under an ice cap so deep that only the highest peaks extended above the glacier? Several million years ago, as the ice melted, it scratched the mountains until they became stony wastelands with U-shaped valleys between them. So many of the valleys were also dammed up by rock and soil, so that when the glaciers melted completely it left many closed mountain lakes behind it.

### Basic Form B:

1. Fog is really a low cloud near the ground. Fog actually consists of many tiny water droplets. These droplets stay in the air because they are so small. You can't see each drop. Because fog consists of tiny water droplets, it is hard to see other things. It can be dangerous if you are driving, for example. Somewhere where there is a lot of fog you cannot see the road.

2. It was once more common than it is now to see men open doors and let women go ahead of them. On buses and trams no gentleman would remain in his seat while a woman had to stand. Men did not only stand in the ticket line to buy more tickets, but they paid for the women's tickets as well. Men called women on the telephone, but women did not call men. A man always walked on the outside of the sidewalk to keep his woman companion away from the danger of the street.

3. There is a saying in the United States that "You are what you eat." While exaggerated, this statement reflects the strong link between diet and health. Most people, of course, pay scarcely any attention to their diet, eating what the traditions of family and culture dictate. Even medical doctors seldom study the relationship between diet and health. They prefer, instead, to treat a patient after he becomes ill, through use of medicines and surgery.

4. Giraffes, who live in the African grasslands south of the Sahara Desert, eat the highest leaves, twigs, and fruit from trees. After they swallow the food, they bring it up again and chew it the way cows chew their cud. In order to drink, the giraffe spreads its front legs wide apart and lowers its head between them to lap up the water in a stream or river. Giraffes usually sleep standing up, but the few times they lie down they keep their necks upright, often resting their heads on the low branch of a tree.

### Experimental Form A:

1. The evening news on television is very popular with many Americans. Th\_\_\_\_\_ like t\_\_\_\_\_ find o\_\_\_\_\_ what i\_\_\_\_\_ happening i\_\_\_\_\_ the wo\_\_\_\_\_. On telev\_\_\_\_\_ they c\_\_\_\_\_ see re\_\_\_\_\_ people a\_\_\_\_\_ places. Th\_\_\_\_\_ believe i\_\_\_\_\_ is eas\_\_\_\_\_ than rea\_\_\_\_\_ the news\_\_\_\_\_. Many peo\_\_\_\_\_ think telev\_\_\_\_\_ makes t\_\_\_\_\_ news se\_\_\_\_\_ more re\_\_\_\_\_. They al\_\_\_\_\_ think t\_\_\_\_\_ news o\_\_\_\_\_ television i\_\_\_\_\_ more inter\_\_\_\_\_. The television news reporters sometimes tell funny stories and even jokes. This makes the news about wars and crime seem less terrible.

2. The journalist must write only what is true. H\_\_\_\_\_ must ne\_\_\_\_\_ change fa\_\_\_\_\_ to ple\_\_\_\_\_ any per\_\_\_\_\_ or a\_\_\_\_\_ group. Y\_\_\_\_\_ should kn\_\_\_\_\_ now th\_\_\_\_\_ some o\_\_\_\_\_ your rea\_\_\_\_\_ may n\_\_\_\_\_ like a\_\_\_\_\_ may ev\_\_\_\_\_ be ang\_\_\_\_\_ by yo\_\_\_\_\_ stories. I\_\_\_\_\_ your fa\_\_\_\_\_ are tr\_\_\_\_\_, that i\_\_\_\_\_ all th\_\_\_\_\_ is impo\_\_\_\_\_. It i\_\_\_\_\_ not nece\_\_\_\_\_ for y\_\_\_\_\_ to please everyone. It is much better for your readers to get news which is complete and true.

3. Luckily he was flying at a good height when this misfortune happened, and he had time to look for a place to land. Be\_\_\_\_\_ him h\_\_\_\_\_ could s\_\_\_\_\_ a number o\_\_\_\_\_ fields wh\_\_\_\_\_ looked fl\_\_\_\_\_ enough t\_\_\_\_\_ land o\_\_\_\_\_, and h\_\_\_\_\_ succeeded i\_\_\_\_\_ bringing h\_\_\_\_\_ machine do\_\_\_\_\_ on o\_\_\_\_\_ of th\_\_\_\_\_. It w\_\_\_\_\_ not a\_\_\_\_\_ flat a\_\_\_\_\_ it h\_\_\_\_\_ looked fr\_\_\_\_\_ the a\_\_\_\_\_ but h\_\_\_\_\_ landed saf\_\_\_\_\_ and jum\_\_\_\_\_ out t\_\_\_\_\_ look ro\_\_\_\_\_, wondering where he was.

4. What has occurred since the last Ice Age, when the Alps were burried under an ice cap so deep that only the highest peaks extended above the glacier? Sev\_\_\_\_\_ million ye\_\_\_\_\_ ago, a\_\_\_\_\_ the i\_\_\_\_\_ melted, i\_\_\_\_\_ scraped t\_\_\_\_\_ mountains un\_\_\_\_\_ they bec\_\_\_\_\_ steep ro\_\_\_\_\_ walls wi\_\_\_\_\_ U-shaped val\_\_\_\_\_ between th\_\_\_\_\_. Some o\_\_\_\_\_ the val\_\_\_\_\_ were al\_\_\_\_\_ dammed u\_\_\_\_\_ by ro\_\_\_\_\_ and so\_\_\_\_\_, so th\_\_\_\_\_ when t\_\_\_\_\_ glacier mel\_\_\_\_\_ completely i\_\_\_\_\_ left ma\_\_\_\_\_ clear moun\_\_\_\_\_ lakes beh\_\_\_\_\_ it.

### Experimental Form B:

1. Fog is really a low cloud near the ground. F\_\_\_\_\_ and clo\_\_\_\_\_ are ma\_\_\_\_\_ of ma\_\_\_\_\_ little dr\_\_\_\_\_ of wa\_\_\_\_\_. These dr\_\_\_\_\_ stay i\_\_\_\_\_ the a\_\_\_\_\_ because th\_\_\_\_\_ are s\_\_\_\_\_ small. Y\_\_\_\_\_ cannot s\_\_\_\_\_ each dr\_\_\_\_\_. But f\_\_\_\_\_ can ma\_\_\_\_\_ it ha\_\_\_\_\_ to s\_\_\_\_\_ other thi\_\_\_\_\_. It c\_\_\_\_\_ be dang\_\_\_\_\_ if y\_\_\_\_\_ are dri\_\_\_\_\_, for exa\_\_\_\_\_. Sometimes wh\_\_\_\_\_ there is a lot of fog you cannot see the road.

2. It was once more common than it is now to see men open doors and let women go ahead of them. O\_\_\_\_\_ buses a\_\_\_\_\_ trains n\_\_\_\_\_ gentleman wo\_\_\_\_\_ remain i\_\_\_\_\_ his se\_\_\_\_\_ while a woman h\_\_\_\_\_ to st\_\_\_\_\_. Men n\_\_\_\_\_ only st\_\_\_\_\_ in t\_\_\_\_\_ ticket li\_\_\_\_\_ to b\_\_\_\_\_ movie tic\_\_\_\_\_, but th\_\_\_\_\_ paid f\_\_\_\_\_ the wom\_\_\_\_\_ tickets a\_\_\_\_\_ well. M\_\_\_\_\_ called wo\_\_\_\_\_ on t\_\_\_\_\_ telephone, b\_\_\_\_\_ women d\_\_\_\_\_ not ca\_\_\_\_\_ men. A m\_\_\_\_\_ always walked on the outside of the sidewalk to keep his woman companion away from the danger of the street.

3. There is a saying in the United States that "You are what you eat." Wh\_\_\_\_\_ exaggerated, th\_\_\_\_\_ statement refl\_\_\_\_\_ the str\_\_\_\_\_ link bet\_\_\_\_\_ diet a\_\_\_\_\_ health. Mo\_\_\_\_\_ people, o\_\_\_\_\_ course, p\_\_\_\_\_ scant atte\_\_\_\_\_ to th\_\_\_\_\_ diet, eat\_\_\_\_\_ whatever the tradi\_\_\_\_\_ of fam\_\_\_\_\_ and cul\_\_\_\_\_ dictate. Ev\_\_\_\_\_ medical doc\_\_\_\_\_ seldom st\_\_\_\_\_ the relati\_\_\_\_\_ between di\_\_\_\_\_ and hea\_\_\_\_\_. They pre\_\_\_\_\_, instead, t\_\_\_\_\_ treat a pat\_\_\_\_\_ after h\_\_\_\_\_ becomes ill, through use of medicines and surgery.

4. Giraffes, who live in the African grasslands south of the Sahara Desert, eat the highest leaves, twigs, and fruit from trees. After th\_\_\_\_\_ swallow th\_\_\_\_\_ food, th\_\_\_\_\_ bring i\_\_\_\_\_ up ag\_\_\_\_\_ and chew i\_\_\_\_\_ the w\_\_\_\_\_ cows ch\_\_\_\_\_ their c\_\_\_\_\_. In or\_\_\_\_\_ to dr\_\_\_\_\_, the gir\_\_\_\_\_ spreads i\_\_\_\_\_ front le\_\_\_\_\_ wide ap\_\_\_\_\_ and low\_\_\_\_\_ its he\_\_\_\_\_ between th\_\_\_\_\_ to l\_\_\_\_\_ up t\_\_\_\_\_ water i\_\_\_\_\_ a stream o\_\_\_\_\_ river. Gira\_\_\_\_\_ usually sl\_\_\_\_\_ standing up, but the few times they lie down they keep their necks upright, often resting their heads on the low branch of a tree.